Scotland's Suicide Prevention Action Plan

Exploring existing literature around social movements

By Heather McClelland and Steve Platt
Academic Advisory Group (AAG)

National Suicide Prevention Leadership Group (NSPLG)

Submitted 31st September 2021

1. Introduction

The World Health Organization (WHO, 2015) describes social movements as 'key to mental health advancement 'and notes that these movements have proven instrumental in spurring progress on a range of health awareness campaigns; from destigmatising diseases to promoting justice and equity for those who have been affected. Despite the WHO addressing the importance of social movements in improving health, there appears to be no formal guidance from health organisations regarding the optimal way to create or establish these social movements. This lack of standardised guidance may be due to 'social movement' being a broad term and applicable to a wide range of causes from global climate change, to smoking cessation. Nonetheless, Brown et al. (2004) defines social movements as 'networks of informal interactions between a plurality of individuals, groups and/or organizations, engaged in political or cultural conflicts, on the basis of shared collective identities.'

One of the goals of Scotland's *Suicide Prevention Action Plan* (SPAP) is to develop a campaign to increase public awareness of suicide. In July 2021, leaders of Action 3 of the SPAP asked the Academic Advisory Group (AAG) to identify what can be learned from existing literature regarding the creation, development and maintenance of a social movement for suicide prevention. The findings of the literature review are intended to inform the implementation of United to Prevent Suicide (UtPS) campaign; a social movement aiming to reduce suicide death in Scotland by 20% by 2022and increase public awareness of suicide.

2. Literature search

Systematic searching of academic databases (Embase, PsychInfo, PsychArticles, MedLine and CINHAL, Web of Knowledge) were conducted using refined subject headings (e.g., MeSH terms; see appendix 1 and 2 for search terms and number of search results). Literature from this search guided investigation of 'grey literature' to learn about any theoretical frameworks or social movements which were mentioned within the academic literature. Additionally, grey literature was searched to learn about social movements known to Action 3 members to identify how these social movements were conceived, maintained, evolved and evaluated.

3. Findings

Over 30 social movements were targeted to garner information regarding the development of social movements, however only seven social movements provided information regarding how they emerged, were maintained, evolved and were evaluated (see appendix 3).

The findings of the literature search were broken into three overarching themes: i) models of health-related behaviour change, ii) gaining wider support, maintenance, evaluation and, iii) other factors to consider. Social movements known to Action 3 and AAG members, or identified during the literature search, are used to illustrate the approaches and methods discussed below.

3.1 Models of health-related behaviour change

There are several theories of behaviour change, for example the Health Belief Model (Hochbaum, 1958; Rosenstock, 1960, 1974), Theory of Reasoned Action (Fishbeing and Ajzen, 1980) and Transtheoretical model (DiClemente and Prochaska, 1998). These models are focused on individual-level change (e.g., quitting smoking, increasing exercise) rather than on change at the collective or

societal level. An older model, the Diffusion of Innovation (DoI) theory by Rogers (1962) (cited in Lundblad 2003), seeks to explain how, over time, an idea or behaviour or product gains momentum and spreads ("diffuses") through a population or social system. What is crucial is that the person or group must perceive the idea, behaviour or product as new or innovative. This is how diffusion is possible. A more extension of the DoI model can be found in the Hedgehog Concept developed by Collins (2006, p.22).

3.1.1 The Hedgehog Concept

The Hedgehog Concept proposes to explain how companies, social movements or organisation move from being 'good' to 'great' and thereby achieve mass awareness and supporters of their 'brand'. To do this, the Hedgehog Concept suggests that successful, long-term goals must be set early in conception of the movement. Using this construct facilitates the direction of the movement as it grows and develops, thereby helping it stay focused on its brand and thereby helping both existing and prospective stakeholders be clear in what the movement is trying to achieve and thereby mitigate any confusion.

According to The Hedgehog Concept, what illustrates a successful company or movement is its ability to find a novel feature or idea which can be introduced to the market or society. The concept argues that three key questions need to be addressed by those leading the movement in order for success to be achieved:

1. What are you passionate about?
2. What can you be the best at?
3. What is the economic engine?

In relation to social sectors, the third question must still be addressed. Collins (2006) illustrates this within the context of a social movement lead by a church. Although the church had an idea for a social movement and addressed Question 1 and 2 of The Hedgehog Concept, they still needed to consider Question 3 even though their goal was not to raise money. This is because the time spent leading their movement took time away from engaging in paid work, therefore they needed to consider how they might cover their domestic costs (e.g., household lighting and heating), while the leaders themselves focused on the first two questions. As such, it is important to consider all three questions of The Hedgehog Concept, regardless of the origin of the movement (e.g., public sector, individual member of the public).

Further examples of applying this concept are outlined below.

Example 1 - CALM

CALM launched a nightly helpline in 2007, however this was stopped in 2008 due to lack of funds. When the helpline relaunched in 2010, it was available for fewer days per week (four compared to the original seven) and for fewer hours (5-12 pm compared to 5pm-3am). As demand increased, fundraising and sponsorship events (in addition to grants and corporate donations) enabled the expansion of the service (number of offices and number of days the service was open).

Example 2 -Movember

Movember was the brainchild of two friends who were joking about fashion trends and expressing admiration for someone who had recently raised funds for breast cancer research. They were enthusiastic about bringing back an outdated moustache style (the Mo) (question one above) rather than raising money for male health. Additionally, they wanted to organise an easy and fun activity in which men would participate (question two above), which they decided would be to grow out-of-

style moustaches (originally, the 'Mo'). Originally the activity was small scale, with all funds being donated to charities. However, due to the significant growth of the movement, just under 30% of funds are now allocated to fundraising and administration costs and invested in future campaigns (question three above), with the rest being donated to men's health programs.

3.2 Gaining followers

3.2.1. Creation

Rogers' DOI theory proposes five main factors which prospective adopters need to consider before engaging with a novel idea:

1. Relative advantage - The degree to which the novel idea is preferred to its existing counterpart.
2. Compatibility - the consistency of the idea with the values, experiences, and needs of the potential adopters.
3. Complexity - how difficult the idea is to understand.
4. Trialability – how much the idea can be tried and tested before making a commitment to it.
5. Observability - The extent to which the idea can provide measurable results.

The extent to which adopters need to be persuaded by these five factors varies, and therefore leads to people joining a social movement at different times (e.g., early adopters, early majority). Rogers (1962) suggests that characteristics of 'early adopters 'of the new idea differ from those who embrace the idea later, which may lead to some being enthusiastic to join while others are more hesitant. This is in keeping with findings by Macionis (2006) who argues that a social movement starts with a passionate few and is only later embraced on a wider scale once others have been convinced of the benefits.

A number of social movements identified in the current search started small (e.g., Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament (CND), Disability Rights Movement (ADL), ParkRun), led by a passionate minority. Those who were early supporters of a health-related 'cause' were most commonly directly affected by that health condition and dissatisfied with aspects of care. For example, the ADL movement was initially lead by US WW1 veterans and made some progress. However, WW2 veterans reinforced this movement which increased awareness in the rest of the population.

3.2.2 The Cultural Chasm

Holt and Cameron (2010) describe the transition from being a small scale movement to being 'mainstream' as "crossing the cultural chasm". They argue that the successful crossing of the chasm is contingent on effective branding strategies and cultural innovation. The movement has to be appropriately and sufficiently 'marketed' and 'cultural expressions that respond to an ideological opportunity' have to be developed. Specifically, the public lend their attention to causes which "individuals can translate into their personal experiences" (Hoffbauer and Ramos, 2014 <page>)

3.2.3 Branding & Public awareness

One of the factors which influences uptake of a social movement is awareness of the need for change in the first place (Rogers, 1962). Many social movements use distinctive branding which helps to increase exposure while demonstrating their popularity. In the 1960s the CND symbol quickly appeared across the country following an organised march to gain the attention of parliament.

The National Alliance of Mental Health (NAMI) used media (e.g., TV, newspapers, post) to boost awareness of their campaign. The effectiveness of repeated exposure through media is documented in a systematic review by Dumesnil and Verger (2009). The review concluded that public awareness campaigns which used repeated media exposure had the greatest impact. A key feature of the NAMI campaign was the involvement of well-established celebrities who discussed their own experience of mental ill-health on TV. This was intended to raise public awareness and, potentially, encourage people to follow their example as role models.

During the two decades, social media have become one of the widest-reaching forms of communication. They can be an effective platform for conversation about a concept, brand or movement. They have the potential to support the development of social movements on a global scale through the building of networks and advertising. Social media played a key role in the development of ParkRun and Movember, in particular when organising groups or promoting events. Bodenheimer (2016) tentatively comments that, although support via social media is vital for social movements to gain wide awareness and thrive, it is not essential for the survival of a mental health social movement.

3.3 Maintenance

3.3.1 Professional involvement

When discussing the social change brought about by anti-tobacco movements, Jacobson and Banerjee (2021) argue that professional involvement should be accepted cautiously. "If volunteers think that capable professionals will sustain the movement or, worse still, that the professionals will not listen to the volunteers, it is likely that they will migrate to other social movement." This is not to suggest that professional involvement might not be of benefit to social movements; however, as proposed in an article published by the RSA (2017), public services should "see their role as enabling, rather than containing social action."

Additionally, Movember suggests that partners involved in social movements should reinforce the message the social movement intends to convey; "One of the key learnings for the Movember team has been finding the right partners and demonstrating a clear impact" (Meade, The Guardian, 2013). Movember initially partnered with the New Zealand-based Prostate Cancer Foundation. However, the growth of Movember exceeded the growth of the Foundation, and the impact of the funds raised by Movember to advance support and research for prostate cancer was less apparent since the Foundation did not have the infrastructure and programs in which such large donations could be invested. Not only was this adversely impacting people affected by prostate cancer, but it also ran the risk of injuring the movement, as the benefits of participating in the fundraising were less apparent and less immediate (see section 3.2 regarding trialability and observability). In order to make a greater difference, Movember switched to an alternative partner who had plans about how to invest the raised funds immediately.

3.3.2 Time

As movements expand, staff (ideally leaders of the movement) must be available to help progress growth, momentum and direction. Without due time and attention, social movements risk failure (Meade, 2013). Therefore, appropriate time commitments, adaptable to the progress of the movement, is critical. This was also demonstrated by CALM (see section 3.1.1, example 1).

3.4 Evaluation

All social movements had clear goals. Some of these were legal objectives, with demands for the introduction or alteration of legislation. Examples of this are ADL campaigning for legislative changes so that those with disability were treated fairer in America. This lead to the introduction of the Americans with Disabilities Act. Alternatively, the CND campaigned for the global eradication of nuclear bombs and missiles. Alternatively, other movements measured their success more quantitatively. Movember gauges short-term success based on the money raised and longer-term success based on reduction of male premature death. Movember, CALM and ParkRun measured success based on the amount of engagement with their services (number of registered fund raisers, calls to helplines or runners within a year, respectively). Additionally, ParkRun was able to infer the reach of their movement. As the number of completed runs increased, the average time to complete the run was getting longer. ParkRun concluded that the movement was attracting more of their target population, namely people who formerly did not take part in exercise. Measures of reach were not identified in any of the other movements reviewed here.

3.5 Other factors to consider

3.5.1 Politics

Somerville (1997) argues that the conception, development and effects of social movements are contingent on numerous predisposing factors, most of which are societal. The most influential factors appear to relate to the nature, climate and goals of the political bodies in power at the time of the social movement (McAdam, 2017; Tilly, 1979). As social movements build in popularity, their influence with political bodies can help bring about the achievement of the movement's aim (Holt and Cameron, 2010). CND, for example, gained wide following almost instantly, as the organisation emerged at a time where there was a fear of nuclear conflict. Many anti-nuclear movements existed prior to the CND; however, these movements failed because they did not gain the support needed for success (Wittner, 2009). NAMI had been established for decades before Congress declared the 1990s as 'the decade of the brain'. This brought instant public awareness of neurological and mental health research, thereby boosting awareness of mental illness and following for the Mental Health Awareness movement. Movements which do not gain political support risk stagnating or being defeated unless a political shift occurs (Amenta et al., 2010).

3.5.2 Onus of change

Holt and Cameron (2010) argue that social changes brought about by social enterprises are more persuasive, and therefore potentially more successful in crossing the cultural chasm, than changes sought by corporations promoting social responsibility or using cause-related marketing. Messages promoting health advantages are more widely well received than messages from movements which seek to raise awareness of something negative or which place the onus on others. Furthermore, Bodenheimer argues that social movements should bring awareness of the specific affliction that individuals can experience and thereby shift away from the stigma that a diagnosis or experience defines the individual. This is best illustrated by the ALD and the Mental Health Awareness campaigns which actively fought stigma and promoted equality for children and adults with physical and mental health disabilities.

4. Discussion

There is no academic literature on the development of social movements for suicide prevention or mental health promotion and grey literature is sparse. CALM was the only social movement identified here to have a focus on suicide (specifically male suicide), while Movember had a more general focus on male health, including suicide. Few social movements went into detail about the origin, development, maintenance and evaluation of their progress, with most information being garnered from Movember and ParkRun.

Most health-related social movements discussed here were developed informally (i.e., by members of the public) with a strong intrinsic interest in the purpose of the movement (e.g., mens health, exercise, equal rights for disabilities) clear, simple and consistent goals which they are committed to. The importance of this focused approach within social movements is highlighted in Collins' Hedgehog Theory. However, the means to achieve these goals should be flexible and adaptable, according to circumstances. This flexibility was demonstrated by the CND, Mental Health Awareness, Movember and CALM.

Most movements stressed the importance of partnering with charities or research foundations whose goals complement and reinforce their own. Without doing so, the aims of the movement may become unclear, leading followers to weaken their support or even join other movements which better represent their views. The size of the prospective partner must also be considered so that benefits of the alliance can foster the continuation of the movement over time. If the partner is too small for the movement, then it may not meet the needs of the social movements. This was illustrated by Movember where the money donated by the movement was too much for the receiving charity to invest into programs, therefore Movember was not able to demonstrate that the movement was making a difference. However, if the partner is too large, the message of the social movement may be overshadowed by the branding of the partner organisation.

Some highly successful social movements (e.g., ParkRun and Movember) remained small-scale for a few years, then grew rapidly. Social movements may remain small due to several factors, including the political climate and the time taken to fine-tune processes involved in the movement. These processes can include establishing 'events' for the cause, for example ParkRun every Saturday morning or Movember every November, for which the movement can become well known.

Crucially, mass engagement requires broadcasting and raising awareness of the movement and its reasons for existence ("back story"). Its purpose should be easily understood, with a clear message that life would be better if the change(s) being advocated were to be achieved. Additionally, movements must be accessible (both geographically, and financially) and inclusive, with achievable tasks (e.g., running around a park, growing a moustache, attending sit-ins) and measurable outcomes (e.g., improved fitness, raising funds, legal amendments) in order to persuade people that the movement is worth joining.

4.1 Suggestions for suicide prevention social movements

Consumers find the cultural expressions of social change by social enterprises to be more persuasive than corporate social-responsibility initiatives and cause-related marketing corporations. Therefore, it may benefit suicide prevention movements to align their values to that of a social enterprise approach. Additionally, based on the early establishment of the ADL and Mental Health Awareness, a movement targeted to reduce suicide will most likely attract those who have been affected by suicide in some way (having attempted suicide or cared for someone who is suicidal or experienced

bereavement following a suicide) in the first instance. To achieve a mass following, however, movements must make the messages and goal of the movement relatable to the experiences of those whom they seek to attract. Additionally, survivability of the movement is contingent on dedication to clear goals and leadership by people who have the qualities (including enthusiasm and/or expertise and/or experience) to attract and keep followers. Furthermore, financial support is required to make the service sustainable (e.g., staff to dedicate significant time to perpetuating the movement or providing a service). Also, the benefits of this movement must be demonstrable in order to maintain and attract followers.

References

Amenta, E., Caren, N., Chiarello, E., & Su, Y. (2010). The political consequences of social movements. Annual Review of Sociology, 36, 287-307.

Bodenheimer, G. A. (2016). The Forgotten Illnesses: The Mental Health Movements in Modern America. *Inquiries Journal*, *8*(07).

Brown, P., & Zavestoski, S. (2004). Social movements in health: an introduction. *Sociology of health & illness*.

Collins, J. C., & Collins, J. (2006). Good to great and the social sectors: A monograph to accompany good to great. Random House.

DiClemente, C. C., & Prochaska, J. O. (1998). Toward a comprehensive, transtheoretical model of change: Stages of change and addictive behaviors.

Dumesnil, H., & Verger, P. (2009). Public awareness campaigns about depression and suicide: a review. *Psychiatric Services*, *60*(9), 1203-1213.

Fishbein, M. and Ajzen, I., (1980). A theory of reasoned action: Some applications and implications. Beliefs, Attitudes, and Values. In *Nebraska Symposium on Motivation, Lincoln, NB. University of Nebraska Press*.

Hochbaum, G. M. Public Participation in Medical Screening Programs: A Socio-Psychological Study. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Dept. of Health, Education, and Welfare, 1958.`

Hoffbauer, A., & Ramos, H. (2014). Social and political convergence on environmental events: The roles of simplicity and visuality in the BP oil spill. *Canadian Review of Sociology/Revue canadienne de sociologie*, *51*(3), 216-238.

Holt, D., & Cameron, D. (2010). Cultural strategy: Using innovative ideologies to build breakthrough brands. Oxford University Press.

Jacobson, P. D., & Banerjee, A. (2005). Social movements and human rights rhetoric in tobacco control. *Tobacco control*, *14*, ii45-ii49.

Lundblad, J. P. (2003). A review and critique of rogers' diffusion of innovation theory as it applies to organizations. Organization Development Journal, 21(4), 50-64.

Macionis, J. J. (2006). Society: The basics. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson.

Meade, A. (2013, 1st November) Movember: from grassroots to global growth. *The Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/voluntary-sector-network/2013/nov/01/movember-grassroots-to-global-moustaches*

McAdam, D. (2017). Social movement theory and the prospects for climate change activism in the United States. *Annual Review of Political Science*, *20*, 189-208.

Pridmore S, Money TT, Pridmore W. Suicide: what the general public and the individual should know. Malays J Med Sci. 2018;25(2):15–19. https://doi.org/10.21315/mjms2018.25.2.2

Rosenstock, I. M. “What Research in Motivation Suggests for Public Health.” American Journal of Public Health, 1960, 50, 295–302.

Rosenstock, I. M. “The Health Belief Model and Preventive Health Behavior.” Health Education Monographs, 1974, 2(4), 354–386.

Spencer-Thomas, S., & Jahn, D. R. (2012). Tracking a movement: US milestones in suicide prevention. *Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior*, *42*(1), 78-85.

Somerville, J., 1997. Social movement theory, women and the question of interests. Sociology, 31(4), pp.673-695.

Tilly, C., 1979. Social movements and national politics.

Wittner L. S. (2009) Confronting the Bomb: A Short History of the World Nuclear Disarmament Movement. Wilson Centre. URL: https://www.wilsoncenter.org/event/confronting-the-bomb-short-history-the-world-nuclear-disarmament-movement. Date accessed: 18th August 2021

World Health Organisation (2015) Social movement as key to mental health advancement. URL: https://www.who.int/westernpacific/news/detail/10-10-2015-social-movement-as-key-to-mental-health-advancement. Date retrieved: 31st August 2021

Appendix 1. Suicide prevention search strategy

Date of search			**13.08.2021**
		Action	**Number of articles identified**
S1	Medline MeSH	(MH "Social Change") OR (MH "Social Responsibility") OR (MH "Social Alienation") OR (MH "Social Marginalization") OR (MH "Social Inclusion") OR (MH "Social Facilitation") OR (MH "Social Evolution") OR (MH "Social Adjustment") OR (MH "Social Stigma") OR (MH "Public Opinion")	118,449
S2	CINHAL Headings	social movements or activism or social change or social networks" OR (MH "Social Attitudes")	8,404
S3	S1 OR S2		126,307
S4	MedLine & CinHal	Suicid* (as a major concept)	147,608
S5	S3 AND S4		732
L1	English		678
L2	Journals or academic journals		678
	Duplicates removed		609
	Titles screened		609
	Abstracts screened		25
	Full text screened		23
	Eligible		4

S= search term; L= limiter

Appendix 2. Mental health search strategy

Date of search			**13.08.2021**
		Action	**Number of articles identified**
S1	CINHAL Headings	(MH "Mental Health")	(88,892)
S2	Medline MeSH	(MH "Mood Disorders") OR (MH "Feeding and Eating Disorders") OR (MH "Disruptive, Impulse Control, and Conduct Disorders") OR (MH "Bipolar and Related Disorders") OR (MH "Anxiety Disorders") OR (MH "Mental Disorders") OR (MH "Neurocognitive Disorders") OR (MH "Neurodevelopmental Disorders") OR (MH "Schizophrenia Spectrum and Other Psychotic Disorders") OR (MH "Personality Disorders")	(332,811)
S3		S1 OR S2	407,727)
S4		(MH "Social Change") OR (MH "Social Responsibility") OR (MH "Social Alienation") OR (MH "Social Marginalization") OR (MH "Social Inclusion") OR (MH "Social Facilitation") OR (MH "Social Evolution") OR (MH "Social Adjustment") OR (MH "Social Stigma") OR (MH "Public Opinion")	118,486)
S5		social movements or activism or social change or social networks" OR (MH "Social Attitudes")	54,799)
S6		S4 OR S5	(149,156)
L!	English		10,016
L2	Journal article		981
	Duplicates removed		750
	Titles screened		750
	Abstracts screened		43

Full text screened	27
Eligible	8

S= search term; L= limiter

Appendix 3. Existing social movements

Name	Geographic origin	Purpose	Start of movement	Ongoing	Reach	Conception	Maintenance	Evolution/ Changes	Evaluation
ADL (Disability Rights Movement)	USA	Fair and appropriate treatment for those with disabilities	1940s	Yes	Global (mainly USA)	World War I veterans	• Joining with other smaller groups • Progress made in changing laws	• Moving from disabilities to discrimination	New or amended laws to include, accommodate or protect disabled or discriminated individuals
Campaign Against Living Miserably (CALM)	UK	Reduce suicide	1997	Yes	England	UK Government (Dept of Health)	• Agreements with funders, commissioners and supporters	• Expanded target group from men aged 15-35 to include those over 35 years those who do not identify as male.	Number of calls, web chats and demand for service hours
Campaign for nuclear disbarment (CND)	UK	Remove nuclear weapons globally	1958	Yes	UK & USA	General public	Branding symbol appearing everywhere	• Moved on to protest the Vietnam war • Changed to protect missiles	Bans on missile testing

Mental Health Movement	USA	Reduce stigma around mental health diagnoses	1970s	Yes	Nationwide. All demographics	Professionals.	• Media advertising. • Adjusting goals to stigma once legal objective was achieved	• Changed to focus on stigma from corporations; became known as 'Stigma Busters'	Increased demand for mental health services
Movember	Australia	Awareness and discussion of mens' health	2003	Yes	Worldwide Adults	Non-specialists: Two members of the public.	• Appropriate partners to fundraise with • Humour	• Introduced fundraising instead of 'buy-in' • Funding at other events (e.g., Ironman)	Funds raised
ParkRun	England	Increase exercise through weekly 5km runs.	2004	Yes	Worldwide. Adults & children	Non-specialists: Informal running group wanted to time their runs.	• Remaining fee free	• T-shirts for milestone runs. • Electronic tags	Number of recorded runs. Average run speed.
Women's liberation movement	UK	Improve womens rights for gender equality	>1970	No	Worldwide	Housewives	• Joining with other activists	Unknown	Achieving legal reform for gender equal opportunities

Recommended citation:
McClelland, H. & Platt, S. (2021). *Exploring existing literature around social movements.* Unpublished manuscript.

Correspondence address:
Suicidal Behaviour Research Laboratory**,** School of Health and Wellbeing, University of Glasgow, UK